

HISTORIC DISTRICT NOMINATION REPORT

Oakland Civic District

Boundaries (Approximate): Bigelow Boulevard (O'Hara Street), Thackeray Street, Forbes Avenue, Schenley Park, South Dithridge Street, Fifth Avenue, North Craig Street, and North Bellefield Avenue

Ward: 4th
East End of the City of Pittsburgh
(Oakland and Bellefield neighborhoods)

Zoning: Mostly IC (Institutional-Civic),
with areas zoned R5 (north of Bayard Street and east of Bellefield Avenue)

Number of Buildings

(not counting additions to principal structures):

National Register District: 35
Nominated District: 36
Staff-Recommended District: 43

Nominated by: Councilman Jim Ferlo
Date of Nomination: August 2, 1991

Description

The Oakland Civic Center, which has been nominated for historic designation as the Oakland Civic Historic District, comprises approximately 125 acres in the Oakland and Bellefield neighborhoods. It is bounded on the north by the residential neighborhood of Schenley Farms, a City-designated historic district; on the west by part of the University of Pittsburgh campus and the public Frick Middle School; on the south by Schenley Park; and on the east by residential and office buildings in the Bellefield neighborhood. The proposed historic district lies on land that slopes gently up from the ravine of Junction Hollow to the south (on the boundary of Schenley Park) to the steep slope of Herron Hill on the north. It is occupied principally by large, institutional-type buildings, most of which were built in the first decades of the twentieth century, and around which there is a substantial amount of open and landscaped space. The most prominent of these buildings are the Carnegie Institute, the former Hotel Schenley (the William Pitt Student Union), the Cathedral of Learning, the Soldiers and Sailors Memorial Hall, the Pittsburgh Athletic Association, the Masonic Temple, and St. Paul's Cathedral. There are also a number of large open spaces in the district, including the lawn of the Cathedral of Learning group (bounded by Fifth, Forbes, and Bellefield Avenues and Bigelow Boulevard), the lawn of the Soldiers and Sailors Memorial Hall, Schenley Plaza, and the grounds of the William Pitt Student Union. The few newer buildings (built since World War II) are mostly located between Fifth Avenue and Bigelow Boulevard/Bayard Street.

History

The Oakland section of Pittsburgh was part of the original Penn Manor, land granted to William Penn and his descendants, which included 5766 acres at the Forks of the Ohio. John Penn sold 270 acres that are now part of Schenley Park to Robert Neill in 1787, and 354 acres in what is now Oakland to Edward Smith in 1791. Smith sold half of his land (170 acres) in 1802 to General John O'Hara, who later purchased Neill's property as well. At his death in 1819, O'Hara owned more land in the Pittsburgh area than anyone else, and left it to his daughter Mary, who married William Croghan. Their daughter Mary (born 1827) wed the English captain Edward Schenley, and moved to England to live. Considerable controversy ensued over the disposition of the O'Hara lands. However, by 1880 Mary Schenley had obtained full control of the O'Hara and Croghan estates, including a large portion of the Oakland neighborhood southwest of Herron Hill.

The Oakland area was originally a section of farms and large estates. This character changed around the time of the Civil War, when the establishment of horsecar service along Fifth Avenue in 1860 made Oakland much more accessible to Pittsburgh. Residential and commercial development spread along Fifth and Forbes Avenues, and along the cross streets to the south, accelerating after the horsecars were replaced by cable cars in 1888. Meanwhile, the section just east of the Schenley holdings, which had been the farm of Neville Craig (called "Bellefield"), was subdivided by Edward Dithridge in 1850 and developed as a residential neighborhood. Small houses filled up the eastern and southern section of Bellefield, and large Italianate houses were built along the streets to the west and north. However, between Oakland proper and the Bellefield section in the late 1880s lay the undeveloped expanse of the Schenley property. Mary Schenley adopted the English policy of leasing her lands instead of selling or developing them, and so they remained mostly unimproved. In fact, large parts of the Schenley property were used to graze dairy cattle, and so the name "Schenley Farms" came to be applied to Mary Schenley's holdings in Oakland. It was generally felt at the time that the Schenley Farms was an impediment to the overall growth and development of Oakland and Bellefield, as long as it remained in Mrs. Schenley's hands.

In the last decade of the nineteenth century, a number of events took place that laid the foundation for the development of the Oakland Civic Center. Mary Schenley, at the urging of her Pittsburgh agent W. A. Herron, began to donate and sell parts of her Oakland property. Succumbing to the persuasion of Edward Bigelow, the Director of Public Works for the City of Pittsburgh who was trying to assemble land for a public parks system, she donated 300 acres (and sold an additional 100 acres) of land to the City on the east side of Junction Hollow in 1889. This land was developed by Bigelow as Schenley Park, the crown jewel of his park system and an immensely attractive amenity for future development in the Oakland area. It attracted Andrew Carnegie immediately, who in 1890 renewed his earlier offer of 1881 to donate one million dollars to the City for the construction of a library/music hall/museum on twenty acres of park land near the entrance to Schenley Park. This time, the City accepted the offer, and after a national competition for the design, the construction of the Carnegie Institute began in 1892. The establishment of the Carnegie Institute turned out to be a decisive development for Oakland,

for in giving Pittsburgh its first "palace of culture" Carnegie had signaled to the private and public leaders of Pittsburgh that Schenley Park and its environs were the preferred location for investment in the cultural institutions that Pittsburgh lacked. Henry Phipps announced the donation of a conservatory to Pittsburgh that year, and it opened in 1893 in Schenley Park. Carnegie himself, his ambitions growing as fast as the public popularity of the Institute, which had opened in 1895, resolved shortly thereafter to quadruple its size and include natural history and art museums within its walls. Work on the expansion began in 1903, and by the time of its completion in 1907, the Carnegie Institute had made the entrance to Schenley Park the cornerstone of a new cultural district for Pittsburgh.

While these momentous developments were occurring, other, less dramatic improvements were also preparing the way for the growth of the Civic Center. Accessibility to Oakland from the center of Pittsburgh was improved by the replacement of the cable car line on Fifth Avenue with faster electric streetcars in 1896 and by the construction of Grant Boulevard along the north side of Herron Hill as the "fast road" from downtown. Grant Boulevard, a favorite project of Public Works Director Bigelow (and shortly afterward renamed for him), was opened as far as Centre Avenue by 1900. As the population of the city spread to the east with the extensions of streets and streetcar lines, the churches moved with it, abandoning their downtown structures to relocate closer to their congregations' new homes. Bellefield Presbyterian Church, already established in the area, was able to build a new stone church in 1889; the First United Presbyterian Church moved into its new building in 1896; the First Congregational Church was completed in 1904; and in 1903, the Roman Catholic Diocese of Pittsburgh began construction of a new St. Paul's Cathedral at Fifth Avenue and Craig Street, to replace the cathedral structure that had stood at Grant Street and Fifth Avenue downtown. At the same time, other institutions began to show an interest in the Oakland area. The newly-established Western Pennsylvania School for Blind Children opened its doors at Bayard Street and Bellefield Avenue in 1894, three years after receiving a gift of five acres of land from Mrs. Schenley (at the instigation of her agent, W. A. Herron). More importantly, the Western University of Pennsylvania, the forerunner of the University of Pittsburgh, decided in 1896 that its campus in the Perry Hilltop section of Allegheny was too small and limited. Its board of trustees sent a committee to Mary Schenley to ask her to sell the school a plot of land near the entrance to Schenley Park. Mrs. Schenley agreed to offer ten acres of what is now the Cathedral of Learning site to the school, but the University was unable to raise the needed funds to buy them. This failure was partly due to Andrew Carnegie's preoccupation with the Carnegie Institute and to his belief that Pittsburgh's most pressing need in higher education was the establishment of a school for technical training. Such an institution would provide students with skills that would be useful in pursuing careers in industry, and would thereby assist the industries themselves in a direct way that a liberal arts school would not. This belief attained a concrete form when Carnegie announced in 1900 that he would supply the funds to found and build a technical school in Pittsburgh, if the City would supply a site. In 1903 the City purchased land from the politically-dominant Magee-Flinn interests next to Schenley Park, near its entrance, and the following year work began on the Carnegie Technical Schools (now, Carnegie Mellon University). This confluence of interest at the turn of the century by both the Western University and Carnegie cast the die for the establishment of Oakland as an educational center.

Franklin F. Nicola (1859-1938) was a native of Cleveland with a variety of business interests: lumber, printing machine manufacturing, real estate, and construction. When he arrived on the scene in Pittsburgh in the mid-1890s, he found the same undeveloped void of the Schenley property that other real estate and business interests in the city complained about. However, in contrast to the other interests that envisioned the eventual extension of the mixed-use character of Oakland into the Schenley Farms area, Nicola held the ideal of marrying commercial development to art. He developed a vision of a new civic center for Pittsburgh, away from the crowding, smoke, floods, and industry of downtown. This new civic center would build upon the new and planned amenities of the area, especially Schenley Park, the Carnegie Institute, and Grant Boulevard, attracting the social elite of Pittsburgh to an impressive grouping of buildings and a select residential neighborhood. Nicola reportedly discussed these ideas with the city's public and private leaders, and received an enthusiastic response. He was able to harness that enthusiasm into participation in the development of an exclusive hotel in a landscaped setting on the edge of the Schenley farmlands. Underwritten by fifty-six prominent Pittsburgh stockholders, including Carnegie, Henry C. Frick, Andrew Mellon, George Westinghouse, and Henry J. Heinz, Nicola purchased three acres from Mrs. Schenley between Fifth and Forbes Avenues in 1897 and constructed the Hotel Schenley. The hotel, glamorous and in a resort-like setting, immediately became the center of social life for Pittsburgh's political and industrial leaders, and helped to ensure that Oakland would become a magnet for social and cultural institutions.

When, in 1903, Mary Schenley died, her property in Oakland (known by that time as the Schenley Farms) was flanked by the First United Presbyterian Church on the west and the Bellefield Presbyterian Church on the east. The Carnegie Institute, in the throes of expansion, sat on the edge of St. Pierre's Ravine at the entrance to Schenley Park, while along Bellefield Avenue was a row of large Civil War-era houses and the new School for Blind Children. The Hotel Schenley stood next to the heart of the tract, while on the Schenley land itself stood a scattering of houses and small commercial buildings, and a surprisingly substantial row of leased houses on Fifth Avenue. The Schenley property passed into the control of three trustees appointed to execute her will. These trustees, Andrew Carnegie, Denny Brereton, and John Herron, sold the property to Nicola's Schenley Farms Company on April 15, 1905, for \$2.5 million. The Company immediately adopted a plan that connected Grant Boulevard with the entrance to Schenley Park by means of a wide tree-lined avenue that ran through the middle of Schenley Farms. Along this extension of Grant Boulevard would be laid out three or four separate sections, each with its own character: residential, educational, and civic/social/institutional. Nicola declared that "it is the purpose of the Schenley Farms Company to make of this piece of property an example which will be known all over the country as a model city. The plans are truly magnificent, and no forethought, care, or expense has been spared to properly develop them." An article appeared in the Pittsburgh Dispatch two days after the sale with a map of the Schenley Farms development, and noted that "in a week or two, hundreds of men and teams will be at work, converting Pittsburgh's largest farm into one of the garden spots of the county." The reporter also wrote, probably conveying Nicola's own ideas, that "there is every indication that several leading educational and social institutions are arranging to locate on the property. One is the Western University of Pennsylvania, which has an eye on a site in Bellefield Avenue. The Central Board of Education holds an option on a

Good-sized plot in the same avenue, and the University Club is likely to build on the farm. Owing to its natural beauty and its nearness to the Carnegie Library, Polytechnic School, and Schenley Park, other institutions in all likelihood also will choose sites on the property."

Nicola began immediately to promote and sell the Schenley Farms property. The University Club was the first institution to announce (1905) that it would build in Schenley Farms, on Bigelow Boulevard off Fifth Avenue. In November 1905, the voters of Allegheny County authorized the construction of a memorial hall to the veterans of the Civil War. Veterans groups initially wanted to locate the hall in Schenley Park, but were stymied by Bigelow's opposition. Competing with other interests, including the Oakland Board of Trade (which wanted the memorial to be built at the other end of Oakland), Nicola persuaded the county commissioners to purchase a lot at Bigelow Boulevard and O'Hara Street in October 1906 (and to purchase the rest of the block by June 1908, when construction started). Nicola commissioned eleven model houses, designed by local architects, that were built in 1906 along Lytton Street to illustrate the character of the residential development north of Grant Boulevard. Meanwhile, Nicola was reported in the newspapers to be seen at lunch with the chancellor of the Western University of Pennsylvania, which in 1907 announced that it would move to Oakland (and change its name to the University of Pittsburgh), and then in 1908 purchased forty-three acres of land on the hillside north of O'Hara Street (for \$535,000). The University had hoped to purchase the site in front of the Hotel Schenley, where the Cathedral of Learning now stands, but Henry Frick had already bought it, and so the University bought the land that Nicola had offered it - and which it was able to afford. Using money provided by Nicola and the state, the University held a competition for the design of its new campus. Henry Hornbostel won the competition with a design for a series of classical buildings that stepped up the hillside, which became known as the "Acropolis plan". Construction of the first campus buildings on O'Hara Street was begun in late 1908.

Once he had secured the siting of the Soldiers and Sailors Memorial Hall in Schenley Farms (thus setting the cornerstone of the civic/institutional section of his development) and the transfer of the University of Pittsburgh to the hillside campus (establishing the educational section), and once he was able to demonstrate the quality that he would require in the residential section, Nicola found it easier to attract additional institutions and residents to Oakland. The First Baptist Church moved from downtown into its new church building at Bayard and Bellefield in 1909, the same year that Nicola and Barney Dreyfuss, owner of the Pittsburgh Pirates baseball club, constructed Forbes Field at the southern end of Schenley Farms, opposite the Carnegie Institute. The following year, the University opened its Medical School building on the hillside and the Twentieth Century Club moved into its Grant Boulevard quarters from downtown. A great step was taken in the improvement of the Grant Boulevard/Fifth Avenue intersection when the Soldiers and Sailors Memorial and the newly formed Pittsburgh Athletic Association were completed in 1911. That same year the Logan Armory, at O'Hara and Thackeray Streets, was opened to house the Eighteenth Regiment, Pennsylvania National Guard. Nicola brought the Central Turnverein (a German-American social and gymnastic club) to Schenley Farms in 1912, as well as the Historical Society of Western Pennsylvania on Grant Boulevard, while the University completed Mineral Hall on the hillside and the Knights of Columbus took over the Holland House at Fifth and Bellefield Avenues. An additional major structure, the Masonic Temple on Fifth Avenue, was completed in 1914, as were the Concordia Club (which moved

from the North Side) and the first Mellon Institute building on the University campus (now Allen Hall). The last three major developments in Schenley Farms before the First World War intervened were the construction of the Syria Mosque (completed 1915), the filling of St. Pierre's Ravine and the layout of Schenley Plaza (1915 to 1918), and the completion of Schenley High School in 1916. In that year as well, Henry Frick asked Benno Janssen to prepare plans for a major apartment development on "Frick Acres", the property he owned between Fifth, Forbes, and Bellefield Avenues and Grant Boulevard. However, the coming of the war put those plans on hold, and Frick's death in 1919 effectively brought that development to an end.

The First World War and the economic recession and readjustment after the war caused a hiatus in the development of Schenley Farms that lasted until 1922. By that time, the character of the area was well established. The southern end, at the entrance to Schenley Park, was anchored by the Carnegie Institute and Forbes Field, which flanked the formally-landscaped open space of Schenley Plaza. The heart of Nicola's development was the intersection of Fifth Avenue and Grant (now renamed Bigelow) Boulevard, where the Soldiers and Sailors Memorial, the Hotel Schenley, and the Pittsburgh Athletic Association formed a major Classical Style ensemble, with the Masonic Temple making its presence felt from one block away along Fifth Avenue. Behind them were the smaller clubhouses on Bigelow Boulevard and O'Hara Street, the scattered but potentially impressive grouping of buildings on the University of Pittsburgh campus, and the burgeoning residential section of Schenley Farms. The principal weaknesses of the development were the largely-vacant parcel of Frick Acres, in the very heart of the growing Civic Center, and the absence of compatible structures along Bellefield Avenue between the First Baptist Church and the Carnegie Institute (where, instead, there remained the smaller-scaled houses of the mid-nineteenth century).

Nicola himself kicked off the second wave of construction in Schenley Farms when his Bellefield Company secured the land behind the Hotel Schenley, between Fifth and Forbes Avenues, and began construction in 1922 of the Schenley Apartments. These were a group of five high-rise luxury apartment buildings, Classical in style, with storefronts on both of the main avenues. The Schenley Apartments were an attempt by Nicola to reinforce the public perception of Schenley Farms as a high-class residential section. The opening of the Ruskin Apartments in 1923 and Webster Hall in 1926, as well as the continuing development of the single-family residential section north of Bigelow Boulevard, showed that the attempt was successful.

Much of the construction during the 1920s was a continuation of the kinds of development that took place before the war. The University Club sold its original building to the Pittsburgh Athletic Association, and built a new clubhouse across the Soldiers and Sailors lawn on University Place. In its use and design, the University Club maintained the social character of Schenley Farms and the Classical style of its architecture. The same could be said of the Young Men's Hebrew Association, which opened its new building on Bellefield Avenue in 1924; the Board of Public Education, which reinforced the new Bellefield Avenue frontage with its headquarters building of 1927; and the Twentieth Century Club, which remodeled and enlarged its home in 1930. At the same time, commercial office uses were introduced to Schenley Farms (in appropriately Classical garb) by the construction of the two wings of the National Union Fire Insurance Company building in 1923 and 1930 and of the Physicians Building in 1925, all on

University Place. The last great Classical monument to be added to the Oakland Civic Center was the Mellon Institute for Industrial Research, which completed the ensemble along Bellefield Avenue. The Institute had long outgrown its original quarters on O'Hara Street when Andrew and Richard Mellon purchased the Lloyd property at Fifth and Bellefield Avenues in 1927 as the site of a new building. The Lloyd House, a large Italianate mansion built about 1870, was moved across the street in 1931 to allow construction to begin, while still providing room for offices and labs during the construction period. The house was finally demolished in 1937 when the massive new structure, noteworthy for its colossal Classical colonnade on all four sides, was opened.

The greatest impact on the Civic Center during the 1920s and 1930s was caused by the University of Pittsburgh's abandonment of its hillside Acropolis plan. This abandonment was made clear in 1920, when the Alumni Hall was constructed on the hillside but directly astride the main axis of the Hornbostel campus plan. It was confirmed the next year when the new chancellor of the University, John G. Bowman, persuaded Andrew and Richard Mellon to purchase the Frick Acres tract and donate it to the University. The thirteen-acre tract at the heart of Schenley Farms had fortuitously remained undeveloped, and it became the focus of Bowman's grand design to not only provide much-needed space for the school, but also to project a new image of the mission of the University, one that would inspire not only the students and faculty, but the whole city as well. At first, Bowman considered the construction of a full block of low buildings, arranged in irregular quadrangles around the base of a thirty-story high-rise structure. However, Bowman and Philadelphia architect Charles Klauder devised a plan in 1924 for a single fifty-two-story tower in the Gothic Revival style. In 1926, Bowman obtained the approval of the University's board of trustees for a scaled-back version of this design, and construction began that same year. Financial problems, exacerbated by the onset of the Great Depression, delayed construction and fixed the height of the tower - known as the Cathedral of Learning - at forty stories. The exterior was finally completed in 1937, when the building was dedicated, along with its companion structures, the Stephen Foster Memorial and Heinz Chapel. The Cathedral of Learning basically completed the construction of the Civic Center (in time for Nicola to witness it before his death in 1938) and at the same time gave the Civic Center a new and very visible focal point. While its Gothic architecture was very different from the Classical buildings around it, the Cathedral's siting and materials were very much in conformity with the general planning principles laid out by Nicola when he began the development of Schenley Farms three decades earlier.

The Depression and the Second World War brought any further construction not financed by the Mellon family to a halt. One sizable parcel of Schenley Farms remained unbuilt by 1930: the block bounded by Fifth, Tennyson, and Ruskin Avenues and Bigelow Boulevard. Nicola offered the site to the Allegheny County commissioners for construction of what he called a "Town Hall", which would have housed local government offices as well as a large meeting and convention hall. Nicola obtained the agreement of the County to the project, but before the deal could be consummated the commissioners were voted out of office. Nicola sued to force the new commissioners to abide by the agreement, but lost his case in the courts. While there was an abortive plan after the war to build "temporary" barracks-like housing for returning veterans on the Town Hall site, it wasn't until 1956 that the site became occupied, when the University built Clapp Hall there on the Fifth Avenue frontage.

The expansion of the University of Pittsburgh (and the related hospital complex) and the increasingly commercial character of the Oakland neighborhood have had the greatest impact on the appearance of the Civic Center since the end of the Second World War. While the Cathedral of Learning complex has remained unchanged as the heart of the campus, as well as of the Civic Center, the University purchased or constructed buildings in all sections of the area. The Town Hall site was fully occupied when Langley Hall (1960) and Crawford Hall (1968) were constructed behind Clapp Hall. The University took over one side of Schenley Plaza with the construction of the Hillman Library (1967); the razing of Forbes Field in 1971 and its replacement with the Forbes Quadrangle and the business school; and the building of the Frick Fine Arts Building behind the Mary Schenley Fountain in 1965. The Logan Armory was replaced in 1966 by Benedum Hall, and the original hillside campus building (State Hall) was torn down around 1970 for a chemical engineering building. At the same time, the University was also purchasing buildings for reuse: the Holland House (1953), the Schenley Apartments (1955), the Hotel Schenley (1956), the National Union Fire Insurance Company buildings, the Physicians Building, the Young Men's Hebrew Association building, and the Syria Mosque site (after the Mosque was demolished in 1991). Other institutions made some changes as well - the Carnegie Institute added its Scaife Gallery in 1974, and the School for Blind Children undertook a major remodeling and construction project in 1989. Meanwhile, commercial pressures in the Oakland/Bellefield area brought about the demolition of the Bellefield Presbyterian Church and its replacement with the Bellefield Towers office building in 1987, and the construction of the Holiday Inn and an adjacent office building behind the Masonic Temple in 1989. While these post-war developments have brought considerable change to the Oakland Civic Center, they have not (for the most part) removed any of the major core structures or impinged on the principal spaces in the district, and so they have not altered its essential visual, architectural, and urban planning character.

Criteria for Designation

The Oakland Civic Center has been nominated to be a Historic District under Section 513 of Chapter 1007 of the Pittsburgh Code of Ordinances. According to that legislation, a district must be the location of events that "made a significant contribution to national, state or local history" or it must be an area that "contains more than one historic structure or historic landmark, or which contains groups, rows, or sets of structures or landmarks, or which contains an aggregate example of a period, style, architectural movement, or methods of construction, providing distinguishing characteristics of the architectural type or architectural period it represents. Each of the criteria will be examined individually. This information will be the basis of a final recommendation to City Council about the nomination.

1. Location of Significant Events

Staff takes its cue in the evaluation of this criterion from the National Register of Historic Places, which defines "events" broadly to include not only discrete occurrences but also patterns of events that have made a significant contribution to local, state, or national history. Staff believes that the nominated Oakland Civic District meets this criterion, in the broad sense. The Oakland Civic District has been the cultural district of Pittsburgh from the time of its initial development at the turn of the century to this day. Its role as the venue for cultural events of all sorts has been eroded somewhat since the mid-1970s, with the opening of Heinz Hall and the Benedum Center for the Performing Arts downtown, and with the recent demolition of the Syria Mosque, but the Oakland Civic Center is still the senior partner to the new Cultural District in the Golden Triangle. At the same time, with the growth of the University of Pittsburgh and the nearby Carnegie Mellon University, the Oakland Civic Center is the educational center of Pittsburgh as well. This long-time dominance of the cultural and educational life of the city of Pittsburgh is a pattern that has made a significant contribution to local history.

2. Contains Historic Landmarks

The nominated Oakland Civic Historic District is basically coterminous with the Schenley Farms National Register Historic District, which was listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1983, except for the City-designated Schenley Farms Historic District, which was designated by City Council in 1982. In addition to this group listing, a number of buildings have been individually listed in the National Register: the Soldiers and Sailors Memorial Hall (1974), the Cathedral of Learning (1975), the Pittsburgh Athletic Association (1978), the Carnegie Institute (1979), and Schenley High School (1986, as part of a public school thematic designation). No individual buildings have been added to the Register from this area since 1983, since they are all on the Register as part of the historic district. One building has also been separately listed on the Pennsylvania Inventory: the Mellon Institute for Industrial Research.

The City of Pittsburgh has designated two buildings in the nominated Oakland Civic Historic District as City Historic Structures. These buildings are the Cathedral of Learning, designated in 1977, and the Soldiers and Sailors Memorial Hall, which was designated in early 1991.

3. Contains Groups, Rows, or Sets of Structures or Landmarks

The nominated Oakland Civic Historic District is mostly made up of individual freestanding structures, which, while designed to be compatible with each other, were not designed at a single time as part of an overall master plan. The exceptions to this generalization are the two buildings that were built as part of the original Hornbostel plan for the University of Pittsburgh (Thaw and Allen Halls); the three buildings on the Cathedral of Learning lawn, which were all designed by the same architect and so form a related grouping; and the five individual buildings that make up the Schenley Apartment complex. In the opinion of the staff, these three sets of structures are important and integral parts of the Oakland Civic Historic District.

4. Contains Aggregate Example of a Period, Style, or Architectural Movement

In the opinion of the staff, the buildings in the nominated Oakland Civic Historic District form an example, in their aggregate, of the architectural styles current at the time of its development - in particular the Classical styles of the turn of the century. There can also be found in the district some of the last major examples of the Gothic Revival style that were built in the United States. In addition, the development of the Civic Center on the Schenley Farms property was an outstanding example of the use of the principles of the City Beautiful Movement, a city planning movement that grew out of the World's Columbian Exposition of 1893. The Oakland Civic Center was one of the few large-scale applications of those principles in this country.

Architecture:

The first construction of buildings in the Schenley Farms district of Oakland began when the Pittsburgh area was coming under the influence of the great nineteenth-century American architect, Henry H. Richardson of Boston. Richardson had won the competition to design a new Allegheny County Courthouse and Jail in downtown Pittsburgh, and in 1884 ground was broken on what would become one of the finest examples of Richardson's particular version of the Romanesque style of architecture. Richardson died in 1886, while the Courthouse was still unfinished (it was completed in 1888), but his example - and his disciples - influenced the course of architectural design in Pittsburgh for a decade thereafter. This influence can be seen in the two very creditable examples of the Richardsonian Romanesque style that still stand in the Oakland Civic Center: the Holland House of 1884 and the First United Presbyterian Church (now Bellefield United Presbyterian Church) of 1896.

These two buildings share the massive stonework, round arches, and floral carvings typical of the style, but the church also shows the influence of Richardson's Trinity Church in Boston, as well as that of the Shadyside Presbyterian Church in Pittsburgh, in its auditorium-church plan. Two other examples of the Romanesque style, though not of Richardson's type, also existed in the district. These were the Bellefield Presbyterian Church (built in 1889 and now demolished) and the original building of the Western Pennsylvania School for Blind Children, built in 1894 in a kind of Italian Romanesque style.

However strong the influence of the Romanesque was in Pittsburgh, its preeminence was brief. It was soon superseded by a renewed interest in Classical architecture. This interest had both negative and positive roots. Its negative aspect was the desire on the part of architects and clients to avoid the excesses that they believed had developed in American architecture in the late nineteenth century: a multiplicity of styles, flaunting a chaos of ornamental elements, without unity or order. Classical architecture, with its emphasis on a hierarchical order and a unity of decorative expression, seemed to be a solution to this problem. The positive roots of the Classical revival lay, in part, in an interest among Americans to explore and celebrate the history and development of the United States as part of the nation's centennial in 1876. In fact, the Centennial Exposition in Philadelphia led directly to the study by a group of architects of the architecture of colonial times. They found that much of colonial architecture was based on

Classical designs and motifs, since these were in vogue among the European models that the colonists followed. Thus they were led to a study of the Classical antecedents of early American architecture, and that took them back to the sources of Classical architecture. Another explanation for the renewed interest in Classical architecture was the increasing professionalism of architectural practice in the United States after the Civil War. It was necessary for American architects to go overseas to obtain a formal education in architecture, up until the 1880s. The school of choice was the Ecole des Beaux Arts in Paris, which trained French architects in accordance with a rigorous academic - and Classical - program of study and practice. Thus, the most highly-trained American architects were well versed in the Classical styles in the latter part of the century, and they in turn were training apprentices in their offices and setting up American architectural programs based on the French model. There was, therefore, a growing consensus among architects about the desirability of Classical architecture, when the World's Columbian Exposition in Chicago in 1893 gave them the chance to showcase the virtues of Classical design in a massive construction project. The example of the Exposition's architecture brought Classical architecture to the fore in the United States, in all building types, but especially for large and monumental public buildings. It was thus becoming the style of choice when the Schenley Farms development was coming into being, and Classical architecture became the dominant architectural style of the Oakland Civic Center.

There are (or were) four principal varieties of Classical architecture in the Oakland Civic Center. The first was the Colonial Revival style, which was influenced by examples of American colonial architecture of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. A particular version of this style was the Georgian Revival, which emulated the character of the high-style colonial buildings of the Revolutionary era. The original Georgian buildings were themselves derived from the current architectural styles in England, which were based on the classical precepts of the Italian Renaissance architects - especially Palladio. As the products of a derivatively classical style, Georgian Revival (Colonial Revival) buildings were symmetrical and balanced in design, with a decorative emphasis on the central entranceway. The details were classical in origin, including keystone lintels, dentil courses, columns and pilasters, and pediments at the roofline. The buildings themselves tended to be domestic in scale, and so the style was particularly well suited for houses - and in fact, many of the houses in the Schenley Farms residential section, north of Bigelow Boulevard, were designed in the Colonial Revival style. Only one building in the Civic Center, the original University Club of 1905, was built in the Colonial Revival style. It was a three-story red brick building with a decorative door surround and a classical cornice at the eaves. Its domestic character was suited to the club, at least at that time, but seemed not to suit the character of the other institutions that came to locate in the Civic Center.

The academic character of the late-nineteenth-century classical styles, which arose out of the study of architecture at the prestigious Ecole des Beaux Arts in Paris, demanded a kind of archaeological accuracy in the recreation of classical elements and detailing. At the same time, the architects of the day were better trained - in both school and studio - than before, and able to accommodate those demands. The kind of straightforward emulation of Greek and Roman motifs that they employed can be called the Classical Revival style, which was at its most direct and obvious in the use of ancient temples as models. The First Congregational Church (St. Nicholas Cathedral) was designed with a complete and accurately detailed temple portico with six Greek Ionic columns, topped by a pediment and acroterion. The University of Pittsburgh

buildings on O'Hara Street (Thaw and Allen Halls) were designed in a temple-like form, with pilasters supporting pediments; they were to be parts of an overall classical campus design that was intended to climb the hillside

and culminate in a large temple structure at the top. The Masonic Temple was designed as a huge pedimented temple, raised on a high basement, and articulated by Corinthian pilasters. The final temple-like monument in the Civic Center was the Mellon Institute at Fifth and Bellefield Avenues, in which Benno Janssen dispensed with the pediment but included colossal Ionic colonnades on all four elevations - with each of the sixty-two columns carved from a single block of limestone. Other Classical Revival buildings were built in the Schenley Farms development, but they were not as literal as the temple-form structures. The Hotel Schenley, for example, was a modern skyscraper hotel building, with accurately-detailed classical ornamentation limited to the base (with its porches) and the cornice at the eaves. Twenty-five years later, the Schenley Apartments followed the same type: classical detailing added to a straightforwardly functional form.

Many of the institutions that constructed quarters in the Oakland Civic Center found the Colonial Revival style to be too domestic in character and scale for their purposes and images, and at the same time found the temple-like forms of the Classical Revival too austere and forbidding. Their architects soon determined that the institutions' need for formality and grandeur, while retaining a scale and character that were not overwhelming, could be met by using the model of the Italian Renaissance palazzo (palace or house). The first institution to pursue this direction was the Carnegie Institute, in its original building. Longfellow, Alden & Harlow employed the rusticated base, smooth stone walls, classical detailing - in particular, the arched windows and heavy cornice - and low-pitched hipped roofs of the Italian urban palaces. This point was emphasized by the construction of two tall campanile that flanked the building in its original form. The Pittsburgh Athletic Association followed with a magnificent example of Italian Renaissance architecture, in which Benno Janssen made use of the sixteenth-century Palazzo Grimiani in Venice as his inspiration. The Concordia Club is modeled roughly on an Italian palazzo as well, but on a smaller scale, while the Young Men's Hebrew Association building and the headquarters of the Board of Public Education are larger versions, appropriately scaled to their sites enclosing the Cathedral of Learning lawn.

The final variant of the Classical Style that was employed in the Oakland Civic Center was the Beaux Arts Classical style. Named after the Ecole des Beaux Arts in Paris, the best and most prestigious architecture school in the world in the nineteenth century, the Beaux Arts style embodied the most monumental and splendid aspects of classical design. Particularly well suited for large public and institutional structures, the style produced elegant, formal reinterpretations of earlier styles and landmarks. The full range of classical elements were employed, including rustication, colonnades, pilasters, and elaborate cornices, balustrades, entranceways, and statuary. The distinguishing characteristic of the Beaux Arts style was the enthusiastic and ostentatious use of this ornamentation. The Forbes Avenue addition to the Carnegie Institute (1903-07) was designed in the Beaux Arts style, with its massive, complicated entrance pavilions at both ends, decorated with Corinthian columns and large bronze statues. The other Beaux Arts

monument in the Civic Center was literally a monument: the Soldiers and Sailors Memorial Hall (1908-10). Henry Hornbostel won the competition for the design of the building by reinterpreting the form of the Mausoleum of Halicarnassus, one of the wonders of the ancient world. Underneath its pyramidal roof, the Hall is massive, symmetrical, rich in detail - including statuary - and expressive of its institutional message.

While Classical architecture provided the principal theme for the Oakland Civic Center, the Gothic Revival provided a continual counterpoint. Based on the architecture of the Middle Ages, particularly in England and France, the Gothic Revival emphasized characteristics and ideals distinct from those of Classical architecture: picturesque instead of symmetrical and balanced, vertical instead of horizontal, idiosyncratic instead of orderly, spiritual instead of rational. Gothic architecture's origins as ecclesiastical architecture made it an obvious choice for the design of churches, but its association with the first universities in medieval Italy, France, and England also made it popular as a form for the design of college campuses. The first major Gothic monument in the Civic Center area was St. Paul's Cathedral, a massive, five-aisled basilica with twin main towers completed in 1906. The next was the First Baptist Church, dedicated in 1909. First Baptist is one of the masterpieces of Bertram Goodhue, who was one of the premiere Gothic Revival architects of the turn of the century. It is noteworthy for the primacy of the visual effect of its mass and volume over the ornamental elements and details that enrich it. One of the noteworthy decorative elements is a tall copper fleche that rises from the crossing of the church. The most prominent of all of the Gothic Revival buildings in the Civic Center is of course the Cathedral of Learning, the forty-story skyscraper focus of the University of Pittsburgh and the visual emblem of the entire Civic Center. The Cathedral of Learning derives much of its visual power from the power and insistence of its vertical thrust into the sky, with the massive tower rising out of a low base and falling away at the corners in the fashion of the great Art Deco skyscrapers of the Twenties. The ornamental details that enrich the exterior of the Cathedral, as well as its companion structures, the Stephen Foster Memorial and Heinz Chapel, were derived from fifteenth-century French Gothic architecture. The vertical character of the Cathedral is echoed in Heinz Chapel, with its tall windows and with its copper rooftop fleche that calls across to the fleche of the First Baptist Church.

The following figures clearly indicate the dominance of Classical architecture in the nominated Oakland Civic Historic District:

Total number of buildings - 43

Classical buildings -	24
(Classical Revival -	14)
(Italian Renaissance -	8 1/2)[1/2 is original Carnegie Institute building]
(Beaux Arts -	1 1/2)[1/2 is addition to Carnegie Institute building]
Gothic Revival buildings -	8
Other styles -	5
Modern buildings -	6

Urban Planning:

American cities in the late nineteenth century were beset by a multitude of problems. Almost never planned with anything but commerce in mind, the cities had become overwhelmed by population growth attendant to commercial and industrial expansion in the prosperous years after the Civil War. Immigrants from rural areas and from overseas crowded into the cities, which grew in an unplanned fashion, governed by the available means of transport, into the surrounding countryside. This growth overtaxed the existing systems of sanitation, water, transport, and public safety, and made the cities - or at least parts of every city - into centers of poverty, filth, disease, disorder, corruption, and congestion. By the 1880s, civic improvement associations and parks devotees had allied in an effort to address some of these problems by establishing systems of parks in the cities. Frederick Law Olmsted (who was most famous as the designer of Central Park in New York) was particularly active in this movement, both as an advocate and as the designer of many parks, including those in Boston, Buffalo, Chicago, and Minneapolis. By the end of the century, many Americans had come to believe that reform needed to take place on the face of the city as well as in its deeper social and political fabric, and that change had to occur in the physical environment and architectural configurations of the urban areas.

This impulse found its first realization and embodiment in the World's Columbian Exposition of 1893 in Chicago, which was designed by the most noted architects of the day in the United States, coordinated by the Chicago architect Daniel Burnham.

Beaux Arts Classical style exposition buildings were arranged in harmonious groupings along the shore of Lake Michigan, enclosing large open spaces enhanced by public art. The Exposition was particularly successful in providing sufficient space for the easy circulation of great throngs of people, and in offering the spectacle of a large group of buildings that were visually unified and harmoniously arranged at a scale adequate for city-sized crowds. While only a temporary construction, the Exposition - dubbed the "White City" - seemed to offer an alternative to the problems of the contemporary American city. It offered an ideal of urban beauty that struck a chord in the general public, as well as in the architectural profession. Visitors to the Exposition returned to their home cities with a new or renewed interest in the movements for parks and "municipal art".

Out of this interest was born the City Beautiful Movement. The City Beautiful ideal was that great cities could be rescued from their present squalor and confusion and made beautiful and noble. Overall plans could bring order to towns and cities, an order based on uniformity of design and on the Classical style in public architecture. The "civic center" was a typical project, wherein the core of the city would be transformed by the construction of a monumental grouping of buildings symmetrically arranged around a public open space or along a broad, tree-lined avenue. The civic center would then be a model for improving the architectural and urban quality of the entire city. The proponents of the City Beautiful ideals believed that by symbolizing and articulating the riches and dignity of the city, the citizens could be brought to love and enjoy their city and then to identify with its problems, assets, needs, and goals. They believed that there was an intrinsic value to public art and beauty that would add to the moral and spiritual lives of all the people of the city, especially the great masses of people who depended on the city for recreation and cultural enrichment. The architects who participated in the City

Beautiful Movement believed as well that Classical architecture best expressed the symbolic and functional role of buildings and open spaces in urban areas - that it expressed the permanence of the city, the dignity of its institutions, and its aspirations toward beauty and nobility. They saw the context of the individual building as the broad surroundings of the city as a whole, and so were deeply concerned with the design of urban squares, triangles, and circles, avenues and boulevards, sculpture, street furniture, parks, and plantings - the full range of "municipal art".

Thus, in the wake of the Exposition, there existed a broad stratum of Americans dedicated to the ideal of turning the city into a work of art. However, the economic depression of the mid-1890s dampened the prospects of any immediate improvement of urban conditions. It was not until prosperity returned at the turn of the century that the City Beautiful Movement began to have an influence on American urban development. The first opportunity to apply the principles of the City Beautiful Movement was in the development of a plan for the improvement of the public areas of Washington, D.C. The noted architects Daniel Burnham (the coordinator of the Chicago Exposition) and Charles McKim, and the landscape architect Frederick Law Olmsted, Jr. (son of the famed designer of Central Park), prepared a plan that rescued and renewed the original plan for Washington by L'Enfant. In their plan, published in 1902, they called for the reestablishment of the radial and axial bases of the design of the city, and proposed the positioning of new public buildings along the open space of the Mall and at the crossing points of the plan's axes. The success of the Washington Plan led other cities to develop similar plans. The most famous of these planning efforts were the ones that Burnham led: the Cleveland Group Plan of 1903, which led to the development of the civic center and mall in downtown Cleveland; the San Francisco plan of 1906, which was cut short by the earthquake and fire, but which eventually was incarnated in the downtown civic center; and the Chicago Plan of 1909. The Chicago Plan was the last plan that concentrated on the physical appearance of the buildings and structures of the city, and the first that included a wide range of other issues - transportation, the economy, social ills, recreation - and dealt with the metropolitan region as a whole. By 1917, according to a report by the American Institute of Architects, there were improvement programs in 233 cities in the United States. Most of these were proposals for civic centers, landscaped parks, radial boulevards, and parkways - all typical of the City Beautiful Movement. However, after the end of the First World War, the planning ideal (as presaged by the Chicago Plan) changed from the City Beautiful to the City Efficient, and the nature of planning efforts changed as well.

Pittsburgh, of course, was not immune to the intellectual and political currents of the time. In fact, Pittsburgh's physical and moral condition was so universally deplored that it seemed to be more needful of reform than most other cities in the United States. The harsh criticisms of the muckrakers, especially Lincoln Steffens, and of other journalists and writers, like H. L. Mencken, was supported and documented in the monumental Pittsburgh Survey of 1907-14, commissioned by the Russell Sage Foundation. Embarrassed members of the city's affluent upper and middle classes joined together in an effort to reform the political, social, and physical conditions that so denigrated Pittsburgh's reputation. They formed the Pittsburgh Civic Commission as a base from which to work for reform. In the political realm, the reformers succeeded in getting the state to revise Pittsburgh's city charter in 1911, eliminating the two-house, ward-oriented City Council and replacing it with a more centralized nine-member Council, elected at large. That same year, the reformers were also able to establish the central Board of Public Education, which took over the responsibilities of the sixty-seven ward-based

school subdistricts that had run the schools up to then. The Civic Commission also took the lead in the areas of city planning and municipal art, persuading the city government to found commissions in both fields in 1911. It also commissioned a series of studies and reports on the planning of the city's downtown area, transportation systems, parks, and other aspects of the city's physical infrastructure. One of these studies was conducted by Frederick Law Olmsted, Jr., a colleague of Daniel Burnham in the formulation of the Washington, D.C., plan of 1902.

Olmsted published his report, called Pittsburgh: Main Thoroughfares and the Down Town District, in 1910. Among his recommendations for improvements to Pittsburgh's physical conditions was a proposal for the development and construction of a new civic center downtown.

Olmsted proposed that the civic center be located east and southeast of Richardson's county courthouse and jail, at the foot of a new bridge across the Monongahela River (which would materialize as the Liberty Bridge). He recommended that a new city office tower be built on one side of a new public square, which would itself be constructed on a deck that would span the existing railroad tracks on the site. Three years earlier, the Pittsburgh Chapter of the American Institute of Architects had published its proposal for a grand public civic center. In the A.I.A.'s recommendation, a large square would occupy the block between Fifth and Sixth Avenues along Grant Street, with the focus on a new municipal tower on Ross Street, flanked by the county

buildings on one side and additional city office structures on the other. Both of these plans were clearly made in the spirit of the City Beautiful Movement, emphasizing as they did the creation of civic centers of monumental public buildings arranged around formal public open spaces. These plans failed to reach fruition. However, while the public sector was unable to create a civic center downtown, the private sector was rapidly bringing a non-governmental civic center into being in Oakland.

Franklin Nicola's vision of the development of a civic center in the Schenley Farms property in Oakland was one that evidently inspired him long before he obtained title to that land in 1905. Nicola stated later that "the old dairy farm having been an object of interest for some time, it seemed an opportunity to create a civic center that would be big in all its phases. The thought was dominant to develop in Pittsburgh a grouping of buildings similar to those found in Athens, Rome, Munich, Paris and Washington. Pittsburgh, great in all things, should not be less in architecture and monumental expression than the capitals of the world. Furthermore - and a very particular thought - was a chance to idealize the commercial side of the development of land." The initial prospectus of the Schenley Farms Company stated that it was the company's goal "to make of this piece of property an example which will be known all over the country as a model city." The company actively advertised Schenley Farms as "the city's social, educational, club, and best residence center." To organize this collection of monumental buildings, Nicola laid out tree-lined streets and a wide avenue (Grant Boulevard) through his development, right up to the formal entrance to Schenley Park. He also dictated building setbacks, to encourage the extensive open spaces and landscaping that City Beautiful planners considered a necessity to impart the proper dignity and magnificence to public buildings. Nicola's vision apparently was shared by a large number of the leading citizens of Pittsburgh, who were responsible for the relocation of all of the institutions that came to make up the Oakland Civic Center. In this, they seem to have been led by the great industrialists of the city, particularly Andrew Carnegie, whose tremendous investments at the entrance to Schenley Park guaranteed that Oakland would be viewed as a prestigious section by other investors and institutions, and Andrew and Richard Mellon, who

brought the University of Pittsburgh into the core of the Civic Center and who completed its last great phase of expansion. This broad private support was extremely important to the success of Nicola's venture, for the Oakland Civic Center was primarily a private development, without the governmental sponsorship essential to the formulation and construction of the City Beautiful plans in cities such as Washington, Cleveland, and San Francisco.

Contemporary accounts in The Builder, a Pittsburgh magazine for the architectural and building professions, make obvious the connections to the City Beautiful Movement made by the developers of Schenley Farms and their supporters. In fact, the November 1910 issue of The Builder proclaims: "The City Beautiful! Well might that splendid section of the city of Pittsburgh, known as Schenley Farms, be described. While civic organizations and municipal officials have been discussing plans for a City Beautiful, private enterprise has converted a vast and unimproved acreage into a section that is rightly held up as a model ..." The January 1912 issue contains a photograph of the Schenley Farms development, titled - after the World's Columbian Exposition's main grouping of buildings - the "Court of Honor". The Builder waxed even more enthusiastic in October 1912: "Few will dispute, after seeing it, that one of the finest Civic Centers possessed by any city in the country, or the world, for that matter, is to be found in Pittsburgh. At no time since the Columbian Exposition at Chicago in 1893 has there been brought together such an imposing grouping of architectural art. The Columbian Exposition was temporary; Pittsburgh's is permanent.

This center is known far and wide as the Schenley Farms, and in this issue we give a few illustrations of structures that now embellish this most notable feature of Pittsburgh's civic life and the aspirations that are entertained by leading citizens to make of the often maligned 'Smoky City' a place of beauty which residents of other cities will doubtless emulate."

Outside observers also recognized the character and quality of the Oakland Civic Center. The most famous of these was Montgomery Schuyler, recognized as the finest architectural and urban design critic of his day (1890s through 1910s). For the September 1911 issue of Architectural Record, Schuyler wrote an article titled "The Building of Pittsburgh". In it (in a chapter called 'A Real Civic Center') he wrote that, while a governmental civic center had not been constructed, Pittsburgh "can not be said to be without a civic center in a larger sense. This it has attained in fact in a fuller measure than it has been attained in any other American city. If at the entrance to Central Park New York had a reservation which should comprise the chief seats of public instruction and public entertainment, it would have only what Pittsburgh already has at the entrance to Schenley Park, partly by natural advantages, partly by private munificence and public spirit, partly by the enlightened interest of 'promoters' in real estate. Thanks to the lucky union of all these things, the panorama which one sees looking northward from Schenley Park comprises and combines the social and civic functions which are elsewhere scattered... There is no other 'civic center' in this country to be compared with this, excepting possibly Copley Square [in Boston], and Copley Square is so much less extensive as hardly to come into comparison... But already the architectural excellence and the architectural impressiveness of this real civic center suffice to strike the stranger with admiring astonishment, and to foster a just pride on the part of the Pittsburgher." Schuyler also described some of the buildings in Oakland. He called the Carnegie Institute "the most impressive monument in the world of individual munificence", the Pittsburgh Athletic Association "the architectural lion of Pittsburgh", and the Soldiers and

Sailors Memorial "one of the most noteworthy buildings in Pittsburgh and one of the most noteworthy of modern buildings anywhere"; and of St. Paul's Cathedral, he wrote that it "holds its own with the other Gothic churches erected in this country for its communion, with St. Patrick's in Fifth Avenue for instance, and is so far a success, a worthy member, and from some points of view the crowning member of that architectural group which makes up the 'civic center' of Pittsburgh."

Boundaries / Contributing Structures

The proposed Oakland Civic Historic District, as nominated, basically includes all of the buildings designated as part of the Schenley Farms National Register Historic District in 1982, with

the exception of the residential section that was designated by the City of Pittsburgh as the Schenley Farms Historic District in 1982. It also includes the Frick Fine Arts Building and the Schenley Fountain at Schenley Plaza, which are not part of the National Register district. Staff endorses the use of these boundaries, generally, but with some minor modifications. The recommended boundaries and the question of non-contributing buildings follow.

Boundaries:

The nominated historic district includes the public and private structures built in the formal and monumental setting of the Oakland Civic Center from the late nineteenth century until today. The basic character of the district is one of large-scale formal buildings, designed in one of several traditional architectural styles current around the turn of the century. It is also one of formal arrangements of structures enclosing public open spaces or lining the principal avenues that run through the district (especially Fifth and Bellefield Avenues and Bigelow Boulevard).

The northern boundary of the district is determined principally by the boundary of the City-designated Schenley Farms Historic District, which runs along Bigelow Boulevard from Centre Avenue to Parkman Avenue (including the houses on both sides of the 4100 block of Bigelow). It excludes the Syria Mosque site, which is ineligible for inclusion in the nominated district because it was nominated for designation separately within the past five years, and there is no owner consent to have the site added to the nominated district. The boundary is set at Centre Avenue, because north of Centre are apartment buildings that do not share in the character of the district. It also extends along O'Hara Street from Bigelow Boulevard to Thackeray Street, to include the Soldiers and Sailors Memorial Hall, the Concordia Club, and the former Central Turnverein building, which were all constructed in the early years of Nicola's Schenley Farms development. Staff recommends that the Commission also recommend to City Council that it designate the two early university buildings on the north side of O'Hara Street, Thaw Hall (the former Engineering Building) and Allen Hall (the original Mellon Institute building). Staff believes that these two structures, which were among the original buildings of the University of Pittsburgh, were integral parts of the early development of Schenley Farms; are architecturally related to the Classical buildings in the rest of the nominated district; and are visually connected to the buildings across O'Hara Street, in spite of the modern additions and structures that have

grown up around them. Staff does not recommend that any of the other Hornbostel-designed buildings further up the hillside, particularly the Mineral Industries Building and Pennsylvania Hall, or the Benno Janssen-designed Alumni Hall be included in the district. These buildings are not closely related visually to the buildings at the foot of the hill, and there are too many modern buildings around them to maintain any sense of contiguity with the earlier buildings that have been nominated for designation.

The western boundary of the nominated district runs along Thackeray Street, jogging in to University Place to exclude the University Club and its neighbors, and extends across Fifth Avenue to Forbes Avenue behind the former Schenley Apartments. To the west of Thackeray Street and its extension lie Benedum Hall, a modern building from 1966; the Frick School, a Classical design built in 1927; a parking lot, south of the school building; and the modern high-rise dormitory complex, constructed in 1963, that lies between Fifth and Forbes Avenues. Staff recommends that the boundary line run along Thackeray and its extension, from O'Hara Street to Forbes Avenue. Staff believes that the University Club and the buildings around the University Club, which were not included in the boundaries of the National Register historic district, should be included in the proposed City-designated district, because they are Classical designs in consonance with their older neighbors; because they relate visually with the surrounding buildings; because they were constructed at the same time as other important elements of the proposed historic district; and because they form an integral part of the street wall that encloses the formal open space in front of the Soldiers and Sailors Memorial. The line between the Schenley Apartments and the adjacent new dormitories is obvious. Staff does not recommend that the Commission recommend to City Council that it include the Frick School in the proposed district. While it is generally in character with the other Classical buildings in the district, the Frick School is isolated from the rest of the district across Thackeray Street, is the only traditional structure in that side of the street (overwhelmed on one side by the bulk of Benedum Hall and isolated on the other by an open lot), and will soon have a major addition constructed next to it.

On the south, the boundary of the nominated district extends along Forbes Avenue to the Carnegie Institute building, and then extends south of the Schenley Plaza parking area to include the part of Schenley Park that contains the Frick Fine Arts Building and the Mary Schenley Fountain. To the south of that line stand a group of new University of Pittsburgh buildings, including the Law School, Hillman Library, Forbes Quadrangle, and Business School, the slope dropping down to Joncaire Street, and the rest of Schenley Park. Staff generally agrees with these boundaries, especially with the exclusion of the new university structures, but staff also recommends that the Commission recommend to City Council the inclusion of Schenley Plaza in the district. It is true that the Plaza has been redesigned in the past, and now contains a newly-built parking lot. However, the filling-in and formal landscaping of the Plaza in 1915 was a major step in the fulfillment of the City Beautiful ideal at the entrance to Schenley Park. The mature trees that flank the roadways and parking lot were part of that original landscaping plan, as was the Schenley Fountain, and the Foster Memorial was constructed with a formal orientation to the Plaza and the fountain. Staff believes that any future large-scale redesign of the parking lot should be reviewed for conformity with the overall design of the Civic District, and therefore Schenley Plaza should be included in the proposed district in order to ensure that

review. Staff recommends also that the boundary line extend far enough to include the remaining vestiges of the outfield wall of Forbes Field, to protect the surviving "relics" of that baseball park, which was an important part of Nicola's Schenley Farms development.

The eastern boundary of the nominated district runs between the older section of the Carnegie and the newer Scaife Gallery, along Bellefield Avenue from Forbes to Fifth Avenue, along Fifth to Craig Street, along Craig to a line behind the diocesan structures in the St. Paul's Cathedral complex and then behind Webster Hall and the Bellefield Towers building to Bellefield Avenue, and finally north along Bellefield Avenue to Centre Avenue. The buildings to the east (and north) of that line are almost entirely modern structures, separated distinctly in time, design, and character from the buildings in the Oakland Civic district. These buildings include the Scaife Gallery (1974), the St. Nicholas Church school (1977), the Atrium apartment building (1979), the Software Engineering Institute (1989), 1950s apartment buildings east of Craig Street, apartments and a recent church north of St. Paul's, and modern medical offices and apartment buildings east of Bellefield from Fifth Avenue to Bayard Street. From Bayard to Centre Avenue, the east side of Bellefield Avenue is lined with turn-of-the-century detached houses, very much out of character with the institutional structures to the west. Staff recommends that the Commission adopt this boundary line in its recommendation, with one exception. The former First Congregational Church, now St. Nicholas Greek Orthodox Cathedral, was designed in the Classical style and in a monumental manner, so that it relates well architecturally with the buildings in the proposed district. It is built at the same time as the addition and expansion of the Carnegie, across the street, and has a strong visual connection to the Carnegie and the Board of Public Education buildings. It is also distinct from the modern buildings and parking lots that surround it, including the educational addition to its north side (which is not recommended for inclusion).

Contributing and Non-Contributing Buildings:

In the staff's opinion, thirty-eight of the forty-four buildings included in the recommended boundaries of the historic district contribute to the character of the district: institutional buildings, often built at a monumental scale, in a variety of historicist architectural styles, during the period from about 1885 to 1940. The buildings that do not contribute to the character of the district, in staff's opinion, are:

1. the Holiday Inn building, between Lytton and Tennyson, behind the Masonic Temple, built in 1989 (National Development Corporation);
2. the office building between Lytton and Tennyson along Bigelow Boulevard, built in 1989 (Presbyterian University Health Systems);
3. Crawford Hall, between Ruskin and Tennyson along Bigelow Boulevard, built in 1968 (University of Pittsburgh);
4. Langley Hall, between Ruskin and Tennyson, behind Clapp Hall, built in 1960 (University of Pittsburgh);

5. School of Library and Information Science, on Bellefield Avenue between Ruskin Hall and the First Baptist Church, built in 1965 (University of Pittsburgh);
6. Bellefield Towers, at Fifth and Bellefield Avenues, built in 1987 (National Development Corporation);
7. rear additions to the School for Blind Children, on Bellefield Avenue between Bayard Street and Centre Avenue, built in 1953, 1956, and 1989;
8. the front/side addition to Schenley High School, on Bigelow Boulevard, built in 1984 (Board of Public Education).

In addition, there are two buildings that were built after the Second World War that staff believes do contribute to the character of the district. These are the Frick Fine Arts Building, on Schenley Plaza, built in 1965 in the Italian Renaissance Classical style, and Clapp Hall, on Fifth Avenue between Tennyson and Ruskin, which was constructed in 1956 in a combination Gothic and Modern style. Staff believes that the inclusion of Clapp Hall in the ranks of contributing structures is a marginal call, because it is not monumental in character, as most of its neighbors on Fifth Avenue are. However, the Gothic design of the exterior and the use of gray limestone causes it to be visually compatible with its surroundings, which also include the smaller-scale stone Holland House (now, the Music Department building of the University of Pittsburgh).

The high visibility of the buildings along Bigelow Boulevard, Fifth Avenue, and Bellefield Avenue - three principal streets through the proposed historic district - is a reason for retaining those buildings within the boundaries of the district. Modern structures, especially those built for commercial purposes, tend to have an economic life of only a few decades, so that in the foreseeable future, there may arise the need to review new designs on these sites in the midst of the Civic Center to ensure the compatibility of a new generation of structures with the historic buildings. As long as the non-compatible buildings are not included in the district in an unreasonable way (for instance, by "gerrymandering" the boundary to include them specifically, or by including large adjacent vacant lots along with them), staff believes that their inclusion in the proposed Oakland Civic Historic District is justified and proper.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Historic Review Commission recommend to City Council that it designate the proposed Oakland Civic Historic District, as nominated, with the additions to the nominated district as described above. Staff believes that the proposed district meets all four criteria for designation that are listed in the historic preservation ordinance. The district was the site of historic events or activities, in the broad sense of being a cultural and educational center for the city of Pittsburgh. It is mostly made up of historic landmarks, since most of the recommended district was listed in the National Register of Historic Places as a historic district in 1983. The district also contains some groupings of buildings that are integral to the historic district. In addition, it also contains an aggregate example of the Classical and Gothic

architectural styles that were fashionable at the time of the development of the district, and is an excellent example of the deliberate application of City Beautiful planning principles by the private sector in the early twentieth century.

Appendix: Building Inventory

1. Holland House / now, Music Department building, University of Pittsburgh (Fifth and Bellefield Avenues):

Constructed 1884.

Architect -

Style - Richardsonian Romanesque.

[1a. Bellefield Presbyterian Church (Fifth and Bellefield Avenues), now demolished:

Constructed 1889; demolished ca. 1985.

Architect - Frederick Osterling.

Style - Gothic Revival (with Richardsonian Romanesque elements)

2. Western Pennsylvania School for Blind Children (Bayard Street and Bellefield Avenue):

Constructed 1891-94.

Architect - George Orth.

Style - Italian Romanesque.

3. Carnegie Institute (Forbes and Bellefield Avenues):

Constructed 1892-95, addition 1903-07.

Architect - Longfellow, Alden & Harlow; Alden & Harlow (addition).

Style - Italian Renaissance (Classical); Beaux Arts Classical, addition.

4. First United Presbyterian Church / now, Bellefield United Presbyterian Church (Fifth Avenue and Thackeray Street):

Constructed 1896.

Architect - Thomas Boyd.

Style - Richardsonian Romanesque.

5. Hotel Schenley / now, William Pitt Student Union, University of Pittsburgh (Fifth and Forbes Avenues and Bigelow Boulevard):

Constructed 1897-98.

Architect - Rutan & Russell.

Style - Classical Revival.

[5a. St. Pierre's Ravine Bridge (Schenley Plaza, now buried):

Constructed 1898.

Engineer - Henry B. Rust.

6. Synod Hall and Chancery (Craig Street, behind St. Paul's):

Constructed 1904.

Architect - Edward J. Weber.

Style - Gothic Revival.

7. First Congregational Church / now, St. Nicholas Greek Orthodox Cathedral (Forbes Avenue and Dithridge Street):

Constructed 1904.

Architect - Thomas Hannah.

Style - Classical Revival.

[7a. University Club (Bigelow Boulevard), now demolished:

Constructed 1905, demolished ca. 1962.

Architect - MacClure & Spahr.

Style - Colonial Revival.

8. St. Paul's Roman Catholic Cathedral (Fifth Avenue and Craig Street):

Constructed 1903-06.

Architect - Egan & Prinderville.

Style - Gothic Revival.

9. Engineering Building, University of Pittsburgh / now, Thaw Hall (O'Hara Street at University Place):

Constructed 1909.

Architect - Henry Hornbostel (Palmer, Hornbostel & Jones).

Style - Classical Revival.

10. First Baptist Church of Pittsburgh (Bayard Street at Bellefield Avenue):

Constructed 1909.

Architect - Bertram G. Goodhue.

Style - Gothic Revival.

11. Soldiers and Sailors Memorial Hall of Allegheny County (Fifth Avenue and Bigelow Boulevard):

Constructed 1908-11.

Architect - Henry Hornbostel.

Style - Beaux Arts Classical.

12. Pittsburgh Athletic Association (Fifth Avenue and Bigelow Boulevard):

Constructed 1909-11.

Architect - Janssen & Abbott.

Style - Italian Renaissance (Classical).

13. Central Turnverein / now, Gardner Steel Conference Center and Faculty Club, University of Pittsburgh (O'Hara and Thackeray Streets):

Constructed 1912.

Architect - Kiehnel & Elliott.

Style - Arts and Crafts.

14. Masonic Temple (Fifth and Tennyson Avenues):

Constructed 1914.

Architect - Janssen & Abbott.

Style - Classical Revival.

15. Concordia Club (O'Hara Street and University Place):

Constructed 1914.

Architect -

Style - Italian Renaissance (Classical).

16. Mellon Institute (original building) / now, Allen Hall, University of Pittsburgh (O'Hara and Thackeray Streets):

Constructed 1914-15.

Architect - J. H. Giesey.

Style - Classical Revival.

[16a. Syria Mosque (Bigelow Boulevard, now demolished):

Constructed 1914-15, demolished 1991.

Architect - Huehl, Schmid & Holmes.

Style - "Shriner Islamic".

17. Schenley High School (Centre Avenue and Bigelow Boulevard):

Constructed 1916.

Architect - Edward Stotz.

Style - Classical Revival.

18. Schenley Plaza (Forbes Avenue at the entrance to Schenley Park) ["Schenley Park Entrance Competition"]:

Constructed 1915-18.

Landscape architect - Sellers & Register.

19. Schenley Memorial Fountain (Schenley Plaza):

Constructed 1918.

Architect - H. Van Buren Magonigle; sculptor - Victor Brenner.

20. Schenley Apartments [five buildings] / now, Schenley Quadrangle, University of Pittsburgh (Fifth and Forbes Avenues behind Hotel Schenley):

Constructed 1922-23.

Architect - Henry Hornbostel.

Style - Classical Revival.

21. University Club (University Place):

Constructed 1923.

Architect - Henry Hornbostel.

Style - Italian Renaissance (Classical).

22. National Union Fire Insurance Company / now, Thackeray Hall, University of Pittsburgh (University Place):

Constructed 1923.

Architect -

Style - Italian Renaissance (Classical).

23. Ruskin Apartments / now, Ruskin Hall, University of Pittsburgh (Ruskin Avenue):

Constructed 1923.

Architect - Louis Stevens.

Style - Classical Revival.

24. Young Men's Hebrew Association / now, Bellefield Annex, University of Pittsburgh (S. Bellefield Avenue):

Constructed 1924.

Architect - Janssen & Cocken.

Style - Italian Renaissance (Classical).

25. Physicians Building / now, 121 University Place, University of Pittsburgh (University Place):

Constructed 1925.

Architect - Edward B. Lee.

Style - Italian Renaissance (Classical).

26. Webster Hall (Fifth Avenue and Dithridge Street):

Constructed 1926.

Architect - Henry Hornbostel.

Style - Italian Romanesque.

27. Rectory, St. Paul's Cathedral (Fifth Avenue and Dithridge Street):

Constructed 1926.

Architect - Carlton Strong.

Style - Tudor Revival.

28. Board of Public Education (Forbes and Bellefield Avenues):

Constructed 1927.

Architect - Ingham & Boyd.

Style - Italian Renaissance (Classical).

29. National Union Fire Insurance Company annex / now, Thackeray Hall, University of Pittsburgh (Thackeray Street):

Constructed 1930.

Architect -

Style - Classical Revival

30. Cathedral of Learning, University of Pittsburgh (Fifth and Forbes Avenues and Bigelow Boulevard):

Constructed 1926-37.
Architect - Charles Klauder.
Style - Gothic Revival.

31. Stephen Foster Memorial, University of Pittsburgh (Forbes Avenue and Bigelow Boulevard):

Constructed 1937.
Architect - Charles Klauder.
Style - Gothic Revival.

32. Mellon Institute for Industrial Research / now, Mellon Institute, Carnegie Mellon University (Fifth and Bellefield Avenues):

Constructed 1931-37.
Architect - Janssen & Cocken.
Style - Classical Revival.

33. Heinz Chapel, University of Pittsburgh (S. Bellefield Avenue):

Constructed 1938.
Architect - Charles Klauder.
Style - Gothic Revival.

34. Clapp Hall, University of Pittsburgh (Fifth and Tennyson Avenues):

Constructed 1956.
Architect -
Style - Gothic Revival.

35. Langley Hall, University of Pittsburgh (Tennyson Avenue):

Constructed 1960.
Architect -
Style - Modern.

36. Frick Fine Arts Building, University of Pittsburgh (Schenley Plaza):

Constructed 1965.
Architect - B. Kenneth Johnston Associates.
Style - Italian Renaissance (Classical).

37. School of Library and Information Science, University of Pittsburgh (N. Bellefield Avenue):

Constructed 1965.
Architect - Tasso Katselas.
Style - Modern (Brutalist).

38. Crawford Hall, University of Pittsburgh (Bigelow Boulevard and Tennyson Avenue):

Constructed 1968.

Architect -

Style - Modern.

39. Bellefield Towers (Fifth and Bellefield Avenues):

Constructed 1987.

Architect - UDA Architects.

Style - Modern.

40. Holiday Inn (Lytton Avenue):

Constructed 1990.

Architect - Tasso Katselas.

Style - Modern.

41. Office Building (Bigelow Boulevard and Lytton Avenue):

Constructed 1990.

Architect - Tasso Katselas.

Style - Modern.